

Wednesday, April 13, 2016

ITEM 1: CALL TO ORDER: Deputy Mayor Smith called the Riverside, Ohio Special City Council Meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. at the Riverside Administrative Offices located at 5200 Springfield Street, Suite 100, Riverside, Ohio, 45431.

ITEM 2: ROLL CALL: Council attendance was as follows: Mr. Curp, present; Mr. Denning, present; Mr. Fullenkamp, present; Mrs. Lommatzsch, present; Mrs. Reynolds, present; Deputy Mayor Smith, present; and Mayor Flaute, absent.

Staff present was as follows: Jim Percival, Interim City Manager; and Emily Christian; Assistant City Manager.

ITEM 3: WORK SESSION ITEMS:

A. Discussion: City Manager hiring procedure

Deputy Mayor Smith: This is a special meeting to discuss what it is we are looking for in our new city manager. I asked for a copy of the job description which we have and we have a copy of the ad as well.

Mr. Percival: I can go through the packet I put at everybody's place. First is the current job description, then the ad and job descriptions from the City of Xenia, the City of Fairborn, and the City of Trotwood. Next are some potential questions; I just went through some of my past experiences and other people's experiences and came up with some potential questions. Then the final item we have is the community profile that would go out for the recruitment of city manager positions. We can take those in any order you would like but that was the most logical order I could come up with.

Deputy Mayor Smith: Since we just are seeing this as far as the job descriptions from Xenia, Trotwood and so forth, maybe we ought to take a moment to review that openly to see if there is something we want to include as well. Mr. Percival: If you flip to the city manager of Xenia, the one thing that is a little different is it does assign percentages to each of the essential job functions. When Clemons-Nelson came to Xenia and did that, they did it for every job in the city. But the essential job functions listed for Xenia are not dissimilar to those listed for Riverside. The minimum, acceptable characteristics are again very similar. The City of Fairborn is extremely similar to the City of Riverside; and then for the City of Trotwood, although it appears to be abbreviated, does call out basically the same essential job functions. So when we look at the position description for Riverside, the essential job functions are very similar to what you see in the other 3 descriptions.

Deputy Mayor Smith: Is there anything anyone would like to add to the job description that we haven't included yet?

Wednesday, April 13, 2016

Mr. Denning: I would like to ask Jim and Emily if there is anything that we don't cover in our job description; you are doing the job, so is there anything we've missed. We aren't here day to day to understand what really goes on.

Mr. Percival: The one thing I really did like that was different in the Riverside one is that scope of daily contacts where it says if you take this position, these are people you are going to deal with either on a daily basis or weekly basis. I thought that was something unique but very appropriate. There was nothing I saw that is missing in the job description. Emily said this was reviewed and tweaked in 2014. Ms. Christian: Late 2014; it was mostly formatting and title lines, it wasn't really the meat of the descriptions. Mrs. Lommatzsch: Fine-tuned. Ms. Christian: Right.

Mr. Denning: I just want to make sure there wasn't something that we missed that we need to add or subtract. Mr. Percival: As far as minimum education, knowledge, and experience, it says a valid Ohio driver's license is required; the only thing I've seen positive that is added to that is "and the ability to be insured under the city's insurance policy". Ms. Christian: And they should be bondable. Mr. Percival: In Xenia we had an employee that had a valid Ohio driver's license but had also had a DUI and our insurance company said we won't insure that person for 3 years.

Mr. Fullenkamp: How can you hire somebody from out of state? Mr. Percival: They would have to have an Ohio driver's license within 6 months; you can hire somebody from out of state but in your background you would have to look at if they had a DUI within the last 3 years. Many commercial insurance companies will not insure an individual with a DUI for 3 years. Mr. Denning: So what it should say is a valid state driver's license and the ability to be insured with the city's insurance company. If they are coming in from California and they have a California license – just a valid driver's license. Mrs. Lommatzsch: And be insurable. Mr. Denning: Yes, and be insurable, I like that idea. Mr. Percival: It's just something that has come up in the last 5 years and it can become an issue.

Mr. Fullenkamp: Why is a driver's license an issue at all; why couldn't the city manager use a bus. Mrs. Lommatzsch: I couldn't imagine a city manager that didn't have the ability to drive through our neighborhoods. Mr. Percival: Let's say you are required to go to Cincinnati to attend a meeting; I think that's more the issue. There are places that have said we are going to keep this person but we are going to assign them a driver; I don't think we are staffed to be able to do that.

Mr. Denning: He could take a taxi I guess. I was thinking more if he needed to go somewhere and check out a situation.

Mr. Fullenkamp: Does he have to own a car too. Mr. Percival: No. Mr. Fullenkamp: They can use city cars for business purposes. Mr. Percival: Yes.

Deputy Mayor Smith: Anything else anyone would like to add? On insurance, I agree with Emily that we should put in there they be bondable as well. In the background check and it probably should be in the requirements as well. Mr. Denning: I agree, if

Wednesday, April 13, 2016

we get to the top 3 and we find out someone isn't bondable, we don't want somebody coming back and suing us because we didn't tell them that. I would suspect if they are a city manager someplace else they are already in that situation, but you could put it in there. That way if for some reason they would lose their bond ability that would give us...Deputy Mayor Smith: That puts us right back to where we are at. Mr. Percival: It also gives you an out but usually if someone loses their ability to be bonded there will be other...Mr. Denning: Ramifications. Mr. Percival: Yes.

Deputy Mayor Smith: Anything else we want to add on that?

Mr. Percival: The next item is the ad as it appears on the ICMA website. I think the nice thing to point out about this is the first thing you see is the map and it shows the museum is right across the street. I think that is a selling point for the community. Deputy Mayor Smith: We ought to include a picture of city hall along with this map. Mr. Percival: I don't know if we can do that on their website. Ms. Christian: We can attached the profile to their website. Deputy Mayor Smith: That would be good. Mr. Percival: The issues we talked about last week – we changed northeastern to eastern, added first tier suburb, and changed gateway to home of; those were the significant changes. We added the number of staff, 65 full-time and approximately 40 part-time and the budget of \$22M. What is up on ICMA is also up on OCMA, Michigan, Illinois, Ohio Municipal League, National Municipal League, and National League of Cities. We have a pretty broad net cast. This was hilarious; this went up and it wasn't 20 minutes later that Mary Ann had her first resume and at the end of the day yesterday we had 6 resumes already in. Mrs. Lommatzsch: We have an envelope in our boxes.

Mr. Denning: What's the normal number? Mr. Percival: My estimate is between 40 and 50. Looking at the different websites, in Ohio there were 2 city manager jobs open currently so that gives us the ability to draw from a pretty good size pool even in the state. Mr. Denning: I think there is going to be some folks that want to go from a smaller municipality to a bigger; then there might be some that want to get out of bigger. Mr. Percival: Down size, I understand that completely. Mrs. Lommatzsch: There is Temple, Texas; West Homestead, Pennsylvania; Monroeville, Ohio...Mr. Percival: That's up around Toledo. We will attach the profile to everywhere we can attach it to so everybody has the ability to see that. I have to give Emily 100% credit for that; she put it together and I think it looks fantastic. It accentuates the positives. Mr. Denning: On this web stuff, did you take some classes. Ms. Christian: I will credit Mr. Daily from high school; I need to send him a thank you card I guess. Mr. Denning: This is kind of off the subject but if you are going to be doing a lot of this, is there a class at Sinclair or University of Dayton you could take that would help you do better at all this stuff. Mr. Lommatzsch: A class you would like to do. Mr. Denning: And if you don't want to do it we can throw it on the IT guy. Ms. Christian: Most of the day to day stuff is done by our administrative assistants and I have told them I would like them to find a course on some of this stuff. Mr. Denning: That's okay, I want us to be helping our folks get better at what we need because technology is where it's at. People are going to Facebook and Twitter and if we need people that are versed in that, then we

Wednesday, April 13, 2016

should be getting them education in communicating with our community. Obviously the newspaper situation is going downhill; they still do it but the more ways we can get information to them, the better off we are. We need folks who are versed in that so we can do it correctly and not just fumble through. I just want to make sure we are giving people the tools they need.

Mr. Percival: There are some questions I think we need to answer this evening. The first one I want to throw out is how many candidates would council like to interview on the first round of interviews? Or what is your not-to-exceed number on the first round? If you say 10 and there are only 8 that council thinks need to be interviewed, we are not going to do 10 just because we said 10 but what is the not to exceed number so we know how to begin planning the whole thing out.

Deputy Mayor Smith: I think it matters as far as the criteria of the individual applying for the job and if we are going to put any weight to that criteria as far as length on the job, in the same job line, education, experience; I think it will decide who is best qualified to go to the top as opposed to somebody who is not in the running at all. The last time we were searching for a city manager, we had an individual from Dayton Trophy Nut apply; I think he was a fork lift driver. Mr. Percival: You'll get that; even though we say we want 5 to 7 years progressive experience you'll get people apply that have no experience or 1 year of experience. Those you can weed out pretty quickly but what I was looking for is as we whittle through the resumes, do we want to interview the top 10.

Mr. Denning: I think my answer is somewhere between the top 5 to 10. I think that gives us a good answer. Deputy Mayor Smith: Is somebody going to whittle this down for us and bring us the top 10. Mr. Denning: That's up to us. Mr. Percival: One of the things on my list to ask is if you want me to also sort through the resumes with you so you have another set of eyes looking at it?

Mrs. Lommatzsch: I'm not opposed to that; I think that's not a bad idea. I seem to recall before that everybody made a list, maybe of 10, when we got all the resumes. Then we talked about who had those people on their lists. Mr. Percival: I think that's a really good way to do it. If everybody provides a list of their top 10 and then we go back and say 7 of the 10 are on everybody's list. Mrs. Lommatzsch: That's basically what we did before and I thought it worked pretty well.

Mr. Percival: The second question I have is for just the first interviews, what does council think about using technology and doing like a Skype interview if they are in say California or Texas or Florida? Mr. Denning: Yes; I think that would save us a lot of money. Mr. Percival: It would save money. I've done Skype interviews; I've done some I felt comfortable with and I've done some where I felt uncomfortable being interviewed over a television set. But more and more, that technology is being utilized for first interviews. Mr. Denning: What was the company Mr. Fullenkamp had us talk to by webinar about the bookkeeping stuff, to put it up on our website? Mr. Fullenkamp: It was our finances. I think you interview them all the same way; I don't

Wednesday, April 13, 2016

think it is appropriate to do some people by Skype and others up close and personal. The format is different. Mr. Percival: Yes; you can definitely see a difference. Mr. Fullenkamp: So everybody is playing by the same rules. Mr. Denning: Yes, with the first interview, do everybody with Skype or video conferencing or whatever you want to call it. Deputy Mayor Smith: Even if it is a local individual? Mr. Fullenkamp: They could come and schmooze whereas the Skype people can't. Mr. Denning: Yes, they wouldn't have the opportunity to do that. I believe we could somewhat filter that but I don't think we would be able to filter it all. But I think before we get there, we need to see what we end up with; we may end up with our top all being local and we don't have to Skype. Or they all might be far away and we do them all by Skype; but I agree, if we are going to do any of them then we should do them all in the same way, whatever way that is.

Deputy Mayor Smith: Talking about Skyping, several years ago we were in the building across the way; it was a field trip to one of the businesses and we went to their SKIF for a demonstration. Mr. Percival: You have the technology here in your conference room. Mr. Denning: Are there cameras for them to see us. Ms. Christian: I don't think so but we can set up a webcam.

Mr. Percival: So council is going to give a list of their top 10 and we are going to compare those to see who is on everyone's list. Mr. Denning: We are looking to get to 5 to 10 candidates, so maybe we should each do our top 15 so hopefully we'll have more in common. Deputy Mayor Smith: I think 5 is too little of a number; I think the first question the City Manager asked was do we want him to go through the resumes when they came in and presort them before we see them. Mr. Denning: I would value his input when we get to our top few. Mrs. Lommatzsch: His top 10. Mr. Denning: Right; his top 10 vs. our top 10. Mr. Percival: There is going to be unique situations in every one that you look at; everybody has a different story to tell and it's what resonates with each individual. That's the beauty of everybody putting down who they feel is important and then there will be a meeting where everybody talks about why they felt that was important prior to your first interviews. Everybody will get the benefit of what everybody else saw of why this was important to them or what did they see. Sometimes you will see something that raises a red flag to you but it doesn't raise a red flag to someone else. I think the process would be everybody is going to list them then we will have a meeting similar to this where everybody has the ability to discuss why they listed this person and why they didn't list that person, etc. After that meeting, we'll schedule the first interviews.

Deputy Mayor Smith: Are we going to have you weed out the ones that don't comply? Mr. Percival: I'm going to look through all of them and if there is someone who doesn't comply or if there is somebody else on the list that maybe I see would be a really good fit that you guys didn't see, but I will not provide any information back to council until you guys have done all your lists. I won't weed anybody out ahead of time. It will make a lot of reading for you guys. Deputy Mayor Smith: And a lot of paper. I remember the last time we looked, we had a 3-ringed binder very thick with resumes. Mr. Percival: Probably what you need to do is as we get them to you, the

Wednesday, April 13, 2016

ones you are interested in you keep off to the side and the rest of them you keep off to a different side.

Mr. Denning: How long are we running the ad for? Mr. Percival: Until May 10th; that was what we decided at the last meeting. Mr. Denning: That would mean we start interviews late May to early June. Mr. Percival: Probably the week before Memorial Day Tuesday or Wednesday. Once we sort through all the information and come up with the list of who we want to interview, it usually takes about a week to be able to schedule those interviews. Again it depends on where people are coming from and some of those issues.

Mr. Denning: We should probably keep May 12th and May 18th open on our calendars in general for us to meet. That would be the second Thursday and the third Wednesday. Mr. Percival: I don't know if the Mayor passed this along but I will be gone the 18th through the 23rd. Mr. Denning: I was just looking to pencil some dates in so we can keep this moving.

Mrs. Lommatzsch: In the meantime we are going to have to do the clerk business.

Mr. Percival: On the last page that I sent you, I listed 16 potential questions that I would see as questions for city manager candidates. Depending on what information or what priorities council wants to see in this next individual, then you craft your questions based on what are the most important things. Let's look at 16; if community relations is important to you, I think question 16 is a great one to ask. Question 13 is more on staff relations; question 9 will tell you who did their homework. Question 6 will get to the points we talked about earlier; that gets to not only where have you been but what have you actually done and it gives the individual the ability to give you an example of programs they have implemented. Question 12 involves leadership. I think for a first interview, you probably want to keep it at 10 questions or less and if there are things I haven't gotten to in this, let me know and we will craft questions around things that are priorities for you. I listed things that I thought were critical for organizational development, leadership, community, citizens, and then some overall experiences as a city manager.

Mr. Fullenkamp: Mr. Manager, would you please email this Word file to us? Mr. Percival: Absolutely; I didn't know if folks wanted it emailed or hard copied. Mr. Fullenkamp: It lets me mark it up easier.

Mr. Percival: I think the critical part about this whole thing is making sure we ask the right questions so we can get the information that is most important to us. If you don't ask the right questions, you will never get the information you are looking for. Technically, everybody is going to have the ability; the critical part is how do they fit, what type of leadership/management style they have, how do they fit with the community, those things.

Wednesday, April 13, 2016

Mr. Denning: I didn't see it in here and I don't know how to word it but I think we need to ask if they have worked with county organizations and their cooperation with other communities close by. I think we, as a community, are missing out on some things because we had a reputation of being hard-nosed; it was our way or no way. They have to be able to work with other large organizations that we are part of in order to make things happen for our community. Mr. Percival: For example, how have you worked with other political jurisdictions and how did that benefit your community? Mr. Denning: Yes; something like that. I think that is going to be important to us and I think it's a place where we have come up short in the last few years. Deputy Mayor Smith: I think that is something that needs to be on there.

Mr. Percival: I will revise this, add a couple questions, and email this out so everybody's got it. Is everybody comfortable with a slate of 10 question for the initial interviews? If you go much more than 10 it gets too cumbersome and the interviews tend to run together. Once we settle on the 10 questions, does council want a gridded sheet and do this on a point basis or does council want to do something like that answer was good or that answer was poor, kind of a pass/fail.

Deputy Mayor Smith: I prefer space to take notes. Mrs. Lommatzsch: That's what we had before; a legal size paper with the candidates name, where they were from, a brief bio, and then space. Mr. Percival: Do you want to be able to actually score the candidates? Mr. Denning: With the anchor questions? Mr. Percival: Like each question is worth 10 points and at the end someone gets an 89 and somebody else get an 84. Or do you want it more on a pass/fail type basis; a yes/no. Deputy Mayor Smith: I would think that some of the questions would have more value to them than some of the others; I would think those would be weighted answers. Mr. Percival: We can do that; one question can be worth triple points and other question would only be worth one. Deputy Mayor Smith: Will we have an individual sheet for each candidate. Mr. Percival: Yes.

Mrs. Lommatzsch: So once we tally these numbers, is it going to be a hard and fast thing? Mr. Denning: I think it just gives us a way – I may grade a question as a 7 and Steve may grade it as a 3, but I think that's a good way to judge it. What is each question worth, we add up the score for each candidate as we get through, and then we have a discussion afterwards; does this add up the way we think it would. We have to have some way to put it into perspective and I think that's the only way to do it. I think yes or no is black or white and I don't think it's all black or white. Mr. Percival: Doing it with the point values, what you still may have at the end is one council member has somebody with a total point score of 77 as their first person and another council member will have somebody with a 64 as their first person, but those are still first for both people. That can take the guess work out of it, your first person and his first person are still the same and it doesn't matter how many points they scored.

Mr. Fullenkamp: That makes an argument for normalizing the scorings; somebody is going to use the high part of the scale and other people are going to use the low part

Wednesday, April 13, 2016

of the scale. Mr. Percival: Right. I was one of those people; my department heads would always want to wrestle with me, they would say you never give us a perfect score of 5 on our evaluation. Nobody is perfect, but there are other people that would give a 5 on everything. It all depends on the individual's preference, but by doing it this way everyone can put their own preference out there but we still have something to compare it too. Mr. Fullenkamp: There may be other attributes that aren't questions but just perceptions too. Mr. Percival: Exactly. Mr. Fullenkamp: That includes the skills and I think we need to rate them on the technical aspect; although you believe they are all going to come out equal, I'm not sure that is the case. Mr. Percival: I'm not saying they are all going to be equal but by the time we get to our top 10 folks they all better have technical skills that are commensurate with the position. They are not going to be equal; somebody who was a finance director 5 years before they were a city manager for 10 years is going to have a better financial background than somebody who was a human resource director for 5 years then assistant city manager for 5 years then a city manager for 7 years; they are going to have different perspectives but their skill levels will be similar. Mr. Fullenkamp: Yes but I still think those things need to be rated to differentiate between skill levels.

Mr. Denning: We can do that before we decide who we are interviewing and I think that's part of when we have our discussion about who are our top 10. Mr. Fullenkamp: That begs to people should be rating these resumes based on some of these things a little bit more objectively. Deputy Mayor Smith: When we rate these people it is basically our opinion. Mr. Fullenkamp: Not necessarily for technical skills; you can take years of education, years of experience and give a number associated with that. Mr. Percival: So what you are saying is based on our job requirements, you would like to see a score sheet for each of the resumes also.

Mrs. Reynolds: I think we need that because I'm looking at what we've got right now, looking at the difference in years of experiences; so if we had 2 grids to compare those. Mr. Percival: We can put something together and as we send the resumes out we will send a score sheet with those. Based on the job requirements as we have outlined them then we will put together a score sheet for that to go out with the resumes. Mrs. Reynolds: I was just looking at one of the resumes, so we will have the grid but we will also need the grid to know that everything have been met.

Deputy Mayor Smith: I did have a question that was brought up at our last meeting regarding moving costs for the new city manager. There was a figure thrown out of \$1,500 to \$2,500. Is that just moving the individual or him and his family? Mr. Percival: The family. Deputy Mayor Smith: Can you do that for that little bit of money. Mr. Denning: The answer is you are going to give them some and once you get down to your candidates that would be negotiable depending on where they are coming from. It's not something we have to be hard and fast about at this point. Deputy Mayor Smith: I'm sure there will be some variables. Mr. Percival: All those things are negotiable.

Wednesday, April 13, 2016

Deputy Mayor Smith: Any other comments? Mr. Curp: I think they've done a good job putting this together and we can continue to move forward.

Mr. Denning: Will we get a packet of resumes weekly? Mr. Percival: I would say weekly. Mr. Denning: I don't necessarily want to get one a day, or three a day; if we know they are going to be here on Thursday, then every Thursday I will stop by here and grab them. We just need to coordinate that with Mary Ann as to what day works best for council. Mr. Fullenkamp: I just prefer an email and I can work with them that way much easier. Mr. Denning: I don't care how we get them, I just prefer them in blocks. Mrs. Lommatzsch: Fridays would probably be best for her and on the nights we have council she can just put them out for us. Mr. Denning: And when we have packets, she can drop them with the packets.

Mrs. Lommatzsch: I do want you all to know the Volunteer Dinner is on Thursday, May 26th at 6:00 for social hour with a pay as you go bar and dinner at 7:00 and our speaker will be Colonel Oberg. If you folks have any additional volunteers that are new this year, please let Mary Ann know with a name and address as soon as possible. We hope to get the invitations out in the next 10 days. The volunteer is free and it will be \$20.00 for a guest. Mr. Fullenkamp: Do you still have the Lions Club on the list? Mrs. Lommatzsch: We have the ones we've always had. Mr. Fullenkamp: Well until last year, there was no Lions Club on the list. Mrs. Lommatzsch: It's all covered and we are getting in touch with Marilyn to make sure we haven't missed anyone. Anyway, if there are any other volunteers you can think of that need to be invited...Mr. Fullenkamp: And some of the people like Dan Ryan who is working on the streets, those are the kinds of people we need to invite. Mrs. Lommatzsch: The volunteer is on the city and if they bring a guest it is \$20 at the door. Mr. Fullenkamp: What do you consider a volunteer? Anybody that works with Dan? Mrs. Lommatzsch: Yes; and we are working on sending out letters for donations to get a gift. We got those paid for last year so hopefully that will happen again. But the date is firm now.

Mr. Denning: We have a dinner tomorrow night? Mrs. Lommatzsch: Yes, MVRPC. Wednesday night, April 27th at 6:00 is the meet and greet at the Hope Hotel for MVMAA. You can still make reservations; I think Mary Ann has taken care of that but you can still get your name in. And you'll probably all be getting invitations to the opening of the museum; probably a soft piece and then a public piece.

ITEM 4: ADJOURNMENT: A motion was made by Mr. Denning to adjourn. Mrs. Lommatzsch seconded the motion. All were in favor; none were opposed. The meeting was adjourned at 7:11 p.m.

Wednesday, April 13, 2016

William R. Flaute, Mayor

Clerk of Council